

NALL Working Paper # 50 - 2002

Emotion Work Learning: Findings, Gaps and Suggestions

Fiona Duguid


the
research network for New
Approaches to Lifelong Learning

Le Réseau de recherche sur les
nouvelles approches de l'éducation
permanente

Introduction

With the approaching two decades milestone of Arlie Russell Hochschild's classic book, *The Managed Heart*, (1983) the study of emotion work continues to be advanced by scholars from diverse disciplines and of varied perspectives. Emotion work seems to be the over-arching term emerging from the literature, and is defined as the paid and unpaid work that involves the use of emotions to facilitate work-related tasks required in and outside of a workplace, as well as, the management of the workers' own emotions in the workplace. All emotion work "typically necessitate contact with other people external to or within the organization, usually involving face-to-face or voice-to-voice" (Steinberg and Figart 1999, 8). Given this inclusive definition, the main purpose of this annotated bibliography is to scrutinize the current body of knowledge on emotion work to assess what is being said about emotion work learning. The central question therefore is- what is the literature saying about how workers learn to do the emotion work required of them?

I begin with a few words on the process by which I have explored this very divergent topic. The term emotion work is not broad enough nor is it narrow enough to concretely define boundaries for a literature search. Therefore, I created categories to help manage and edit the information collected; these include: emotions in the workplace; emotion work relating to stress, job burnout, and emotionally exhausting workloads; managing emotions in the workplace; definitions and meanings of emotion work; and emotion work learningⁱ. While literature in all of these categories does discuss emotions and work, not all of them are directly on the topic of emotion work learning per seⁱⁱ. Many of these topics are notably interesting and prevalent in today's workplaces; however, for the purpose of this annotated bibliography I focus on the final category, emotion work learning, following a brief discussion of the trends and patterns in the literature in emotion work.

Patterns and Trends in the Emotion Work Literature

There are three debates that many of the theorists writing on emotion work seem to be most concerned about- (1) the definition of emotion work, (2) the gendered nature of this work, and (3) the distinction between paid and unpaid work. Each of these is discussed briefly below. Following is a brief discussion about methodological approaches.

The literature on emotion work is perplexing because of the different terms used to describe similar or distinct issues, problems and concepts. Aside from the broad term emotion work there are three other terms used to describe the work involved in managing feelings- caring work (England and Folbre 1999), caring labour (Himmelweit 1999), and emotional labour (Hochschild 1983, James 1989, Ashforth 1993, DeVault 1999). These terms are closely related and overlapping, and there is much debate in the literature on the distinction and definitions of these terms.

The gendered nature of emotion work rises resolutely from the literature. Almost all of the articles make some reference to women's work; feminization of emotion work; gender roles and expectations; women and emotion work of all kinds; and especially to caring labour and work. As Firth and Kitzinger state, "emotion work is depicted as a form of exploitation which involves the subordination of women's emotional needs to those of others" (1998, 304). In Pierce's ethnography of paralegals she considers "not only the structural characteristics of law

firms and the role of legal workers but also emotions, or ‘emotional labor’, as a site for the reproduction of gender” (1995, 3).

Not only are most lawyers men, but lawyers do the intellectual, analytic, prestigious, and well-paid work- work that is commonly referred to as ‘men’s work’. By contrast, female paralegals and secretaries supposedly do the routine, semi-skilled, low status, and low-paid clerical or ‘women’s work’.... Women as paralegals are expected to provide emotional services such as nurturance and deference to the lawyers for whom they work, whereas men as attorneys are required to be aggressive and manipulative. (Pierce 1995, 31)

A further example of gender and emotion work is Diane Perrons article, “Care, paid work, and leisure: rounding the triangle” (2000). In this article she states that “the current distribution of paid and caring work is inequitable” (105). She argues that “in practice, distinctions between work, care and leisure are blurred. Correspondingly the division of (women’s) labour and time needs to be spread more evenly between these activities” (110). Hirschman states of Joan Tronto’s book, *Moral Boundaries*, that “we currently do not see care as political in part because of the traditional associations of women with caring.... Tronto points out that care has been performed historically not just by ‘women’... but also by men and women of color and poor men and women (1998, 107). While Rutman maintains “caregiving most often is women’s work- regardless of whether the care is provided to children or to elders, whether the labor is paid or unpaid, or whether the care is delivered in home or in institutional or center environments (1996, 629). Here I have highlighted just a few of the innumerable issues of invisibility, equity, power relations, equality, accessibility, and exploitation that directly relate to the gendered nature of emotion work. While the literature does highlight the gendered nature of emotion work, it does not sufficiently describe or relate the inter-relational effects of gender, race and class in emotion work.

Work that is paid and work that is unpaid are both featured in the literature. Using the definitions described above, paid work is defined as labour, whereas unpaid work is labeled work. There are many similar issues in both paid and unpaid workplaces and spheres- invisibility; undervalued; gender, class and race stereotypes and inequalities; and societal expectations (Hochschild 1979, Hochschild 1983, Pierce 1995, Steinberg and Figart 1999, DeVault 1999, Ashforth 1993, James 1989, Tronto 1993, Himmelweit 1999, England and Folbre 1999, among others). However, as the researchers point out, paid work and unpaid work are also intrinsically different. There is much discussion about the distinction between paid and unpaid work, and whether caring work can be monetarily compensated for (Steinberg and Figart 1999a). Caring labour, paid work that involves dealing with the feelings of others and an assumption that the worker cares about the feelings of others, is the most prevalent subset of emotion workⁱⁱⁱ. The reason for this attention has been alluded to by Perrons. Increasingly the boundaries between paid labour, workplaces, unpaid work, and the home have been blurred. In addition, the reality that women labour outside of the home (as well working in the home) breaks down the previously defined gender roles. Researchers are making visible caring labour not only as an academic topic, but as a reality for many paid workers. Many of the case studies on caring labour examine home care support workers, nursing, social workers, child care workers, counsellors, and teachers. Studies looking at emotional labour, the paid work that requires the worker to manage their emotions to create an scripted scenario for clients, are also widely researched^{iv}. Case studies in this work arena are customer service employees, supermarket clerks, managers, and office workers. The research on caring work is exclusively about the unpaid caring work women do almost on a daily basis^v. The case studies on caring work involve

working at home with family; aiding children, the elderly, the sick or the terminally ill; and teaching. Researchers show that unpaid caring work often crosses over the boundaries into the paid work sphere because of societal expectations and perceived gender typecasts. Interestingly there is very little literature directly on emotional work; although the categories emotions management and emotion in the workplace do touch on this concept. There could be a couple of things going here. People may not highlight their emotional work in their job descriptions^{vi}, or people often do not do emotional work when it involves little or no monetary compensation; whereas, there is an intrinsic understanding that caring work can not and should not have a pricetag put on it. This is especially interesting given that women do most of the caring work.

Methodologically, emotion work has mostly been studied through and using case studies. Case studies of unpaid emotion work include: women (Erickson 1993; Fioze 1996; Glazer 1993; McClelland 1993; Roch 1995), and family workers (Devault 1999; Erickson 1999). Case studies of paid emotion work include: professors (Acker 1997, 1999, 2000; Bellas 1999; Brown 1997), service industry (Abaila 1999; Hall 1993; Leidner 1999; Tolich 1993; England 1999), counsellors (Austin 1993), educators (Cameron 1998; Chin 2000; Cole 1999; Crawford 1993; Elderidge 1996), social service workers (Anderson 2000; Ashforth 1993; Ebenstein 1998; Rutman 1996), and health care professionals (Davies 1995; Deary 1996; Fagin 1996; Imperto 1996; Kinder 2000; Papadatou 1997; Pierson 1995; Porter 1996). The use of case studies serves the researchers well, as they ground theories of emotion work in the every day, public and private spheres.

Emotion Work Learning

The information and discussions about emotion work learning, the main topic of this annotated bibliography, is shallow and unexplored. For the large part the processes, structures, theories, ideas, and procedures that explain and consider the learning workers do to negotiate their emotion work is ignored, glazed over and/or left out. While there are many articles on emotion work (over 90 that I have found), it is surprising that no one has considered this topic directly, and that the emotion work learning content that is available is sparse, vague and incomplete^{vii}. In fact throughout many of the articles I kept asking myself in frustration the question, ‘how do they learn how to do the emotion work described?’ (Steinberg and Figart 1999; Bellas 1999; Heimer and Stephens 1997; England and Folbre 1999; DeVault 1999; Steinberg and Figart 1999; among many others). Given this, a number of articles indirectly discuss learning by using words and concepts such as socialization, training, inherent, indoctrination, stereotypical associations, and strategies. The rest of this section is dedicated to providing and assessing the examples of emotion work learning that the literature contributes.

England and Folbre nudge up against the concept of learning when they asked in their concluding remarks, “What kinds of institutional features and work organization foster the cultivation of genuinely caring motives among workers?” (1999, 47). As does James, “emotional labour requires learned skills in the same way that physical labour does. Access to the skills is open to anyone who has the interest or who has an obligation to learn them...” (1989, 26). And Imperato goes so far as to say of caring that “it is learned in childhood, nurtured in adolescence and adulthood, and cultivated in professional schools” (1996, 157). However, none of these authors answer their own questions, nor do they provide insight into the tools used to learn the skills cultivated and nurtured.

I have grouped allusions to learning found in the literature into eight themes- training and formal schooling; memorizing and indoctrination; socialization/ natural abilities; cultural norms/intuitively understood; talking with peers or professional socialization; employee recruitment; role playing/imagination; and experiential learning^{viii}.

Training and formal schooling is featured in a number of articles (Steinberg and Figart 1999; Imperato 1996; Ebenstein 1998, 1999; Nelson and Barley 1997; Wisely 1997; and Leidner 1999). “Service workers may, for example, be trained to greet customer in a certain way, to smile, make eye contact, thank customers, and close a transaction with ‘Have a nice day’” (Steinberg and Figart 1999, 11). Or Imperato declares that doctors “have been well prepared to step into this exciting world by faculties of their professional schools. Through continuing education and career development, they can remain active and vital members of their professions for many years to come” (1996, 157).

While memorization and indoctrination are two very different teaching tactics, they have similar outcomes according to Steinberg and Figart 1999, and Leidner 1999. “Insurance sales agents learn very specific and detailed scripts for handling the patterned responses they are likely to receive as they knock on people’s doors (Steinberg and Figart 1999, 11). Leidner maintains that

“once employees are hired, organizations use a variety of techniques to instill organizationally favored attitudes and to teach new staff how to do their jobs and comply with organizational rules. An important component of orientation programs and of ongoing employee relations efforts in many workplaces is indoctrination with company culture.” (Leidner, 1999,86)

Most often exploited or denounced as a learning tactic, is the concept socialization or natural abilities (Steinberg and Figart 1999; England and Folbre 1999; Bellas 1999; James 1989; Steinberg and Figart 1999b; among many others). Some authors suggest that people are ‘meant’ for their jobs. Most often what is actually being said is that women are ‘meant’ to be in their caring role. As James states, “the supposed ‘naturalness’ of women’s caring role is central to the significance, value and invisibility of emotional labour” (1989, 22). Or “despite the skills involved in effective teaching, like so much of so-called women’s work teaching appears to draw on natural abilities” (Bellas, 1999, 98).

Similar to socialization as a learning process, are cultural norms and intuitively understood as learning tactics (Steinberg and Figart 1999; and Ebenstein 1998). Steinberg and Figart claim that there is an “influence of cultural norms on selecting the appropriate person to perform different jobs. Gender is implicated within these social norms, which vary by culture (1999, 17). Ebenstein declares about home care workers that “they intuitively understood that stimulation increased alertness and strengthened connections to the outside world” (1998, 194).

Talking with peers and professional socialization are also learning processes alluded too (DeVault 1999; and Bellas 1999). DeVault in her discussion about lesbian parents suggests that parents “contact other parents to discuss issues that arise in their children’s friendships” (1999, 60). Whereas Bellas suggests that “professors learn these feeling rules through professional socialization and explicit organizational or occupational codes of conduct” (1999, 97).

Employee recruitment is another apparent process by which people learn in their jobs (England and Folbre 1999; Steinberg and Figart, 1999; and Leidner 1999). England and Folbre highlight this process. “The process of learning a skill often goes hand in hand with developing a preference for exercising that skill, so that by selecting people with the skills for a job, employers

unwittingly select more of those who would take the job for lower pay than others” (1999, 44). Steinberg and Figart blatantly state, “understanding the role that emotion plays can help organizations recruit properly socialized employees” (1999, 17).

Ebenstein (1998) and Lois (2001) both make reference to role playing and imagining as ways of learning to do emotion work. Of a home care worker’s learning technique Ebenstein explains that “imagining how the world looked through their client’s eyes helped a worker understand the client’s needs and reasons for behaviour that may have at first appeared unreasonable” (1998,193). Jennifer Lois highlights one way that a rescuer worker learns their emotion work. “Preparing for edgework by imagining numerous different scenarios gave them some sense of control of the unpredictable future, and through such planning, they were able to manage their uncomfortable anticipatory feelings about the unknown” (2001, 386).

And the final allusion to learning in the literature is experiential learning (Nelson and Barley 1997; and Bellas 1999). As Nelson and Barley state, for seasoned emergency medical technicians “being skilled, therefore, meant more than having formal knowledge of what to do. ‘Real’ expertise was viewed as a type of interpretive finesse, the ability to innovate around the particulars of a case that comes only after work has become truly routine” (1997, 632). Or as Bellas asserts of professors “who improve their teaching tend to do so through trial and error and feedback from students” (1999, 98).

Workers must and need to learn how to do the emotion work involved in their jobs, whether the work is paid or unpaid. The literature does not directly discuss these processes, and as the examples expose, even indirectly the information serves only as a springboard. In addition, articles (i.e. Steinberg and Figart 1999) that discuss patterns in the research and further research suggestions do not prompt the field to think about learning methods, theories or procedures.

Conclusions and Ideas for Further Research

Emotion work as a field of study has grown extensively, and is increasingly becoming visible to researchers in a wide range of disciplines, as well as to employers and the general public. While scholars are looking at a wide range of issues relating to emotion work, and various forms of emotion work, there are a number of gaps and critical issues. This brings me back to the central question of the annotated bibliography- what is the literature saying about how workers learn to do the emotion work require of them? After completing an extensive literature search and analyzing numerous articles I can fairly say scholars have not fully explored the ways in which diversely situated individuals and groups learn to do emotion work.

From these conclusions, further research suggestions obviously include empirically studying emotion work learning in general and specifically. How do workers learn to do the emotion work involved in their paid or unpaid jobs? This could be done through a case study of a profession that does caring or emotional labour. Or a number of case studies in a wide range of professions. Or by interviewing unpaid caring or emotional workers. Or by following up on any or all of the learning processes alluded to in the literature and discussed here. Or by comparing the learning processes and theories between unpaid and paid caring and emotion workers. In studying emotion work learning, insights on equity, inconsistencies, availability, accessibility, power relations, and much more could be unearthed, emphasized, and addressed.

The following is a cross-referenced bibliography including all of the literature discussed. The first part, contains information pertaining to Emotion work, stress, job burnout and emotionally exhausting workloads; Emotions management; and Emotions in the workplace. The

second part, highlights the literature on Caring labour; Emotional labour; and Caring work and emotional work. And the third part includes all of the literature that makes reference to Emotion work learning, divided into the various techniques of learning discussed.

Annotated Bibliography

The information found in the annotated bibliography was taken from the authors' abstract of article, or the summary of book chapters, or a summary of the authors' main ideas as in the case of books.

Part I: All Literature

Emotion work relating to stress, job burnout and emotionally exhausting

Anderson, D. G. (2000). Coping strategies and burnout among veteran child protection workers. Child and Neglect, 24(6), 839-848.

A study was conducted to examine how veteran child protective service (CPS) investigations workers fight job stress and to investigate the relationship between coping strategies and levels of emotional exhaustion, depersonalization, and sense of reduced accomplishment (burnout syndrome). Data were drawn from 151 front-line CPS workers in a southeastern Department of Social Services who took part in one of nine stress management workshops. Findings reveal that neither the employment of active nor avoidant coping strategies prevented these workers from experiencing Emotional Exhaustion. It is noted that the problem-focused strategies that they learn and mostly employ do not aid them to deal with the emotional content and context of their work. It is suggested that emotion-focused coping should be employed to prevent and to remedy burnout.

Deary, Ian J., Agius, R.M. & Sadler A. (1996). Models of job-related stress and personal achievement among consultant doctors. British Journal of Psychology, 87(Feb), 3-29.

The antecedents and outcomes of feelings of job-related stress and personal achievement were studied in a large sample of consultant doctors working in Scotland. In a sample of 333 doctors it was found that a tendency to use emotion-oriented coping strategies and negative appraisals of organizational changes in the practice of medicine mediated the effect of the personality dimension of Neuroticism on reported job stress. Job stress levels predicted the degree of 'burnout experienced by doctors, i.e. their tendencies to be emotionally exhausted by their work and to dehumanize patients. Higher clinical workloads were related to higher levels of stress but also to higher feelings of personal achievement. A substantial proportion of the variance in many of the variables in the stress model was accounted for by a general tendency to experience negative emotions, closely related to Neuroticism; this general factor appeared to be similar to the recently formulated concepts of 'negative affectivity' and to somatopsychic distress. The personality factors of Extraversion and Conscientiousness both contributed to positive feelings of personal achievement (N = 344); the effect of Extraversion was direct, whereas the effect of Conscientiousness was mediated by a tendency to use task-oriented coping strategies. Models of the processes of stress and personal achievement were tested for acceptability using the EQS Structural Equations Program. The implications of the models for transactional theories of stress are discussed.

Deary, Ian J., Agius, R. M. & Sadler A. (1996). Personality and stress in consultant psychiatrists. International Journal of Social Psychiatry, 42(2), 112-124.

In a study, a group of consultant psychiatrists practicing in the NHS in Scotland was compared

with a group of physicians and surgeons regarding the stress process, including personality traits, burnout and other factors.

Fagin, L., Carson, J., Leary, J., & al.(1996). Stress, coping and burnout in mental health nurses: findings from three research studies. International Journal of Social Psychiatry, 42(2), 102-112.

Data from three research studies on stress, coping and burnout in mental health nurses are presented. All of the studies used a range of self- report questionnaires.

Kahn, W. A. (1993). Caring for the caregivers: patterns of institutional caregiving. Administrative Science Quarterly, 38(4), 539- 563.

A study offers a system-level perspective on job burnout among human service workers by focusing on their internal networks of caregiving relationships. A qualitative case study of a social service agency reveals how primary caregivers may be filled with or emptied of emotional resources necessary for caregiving in interactions with other agency members. Working from 8 key behavioral dimensions of caregiving derived from the study, 5 recurring patterns of caregiving that characterized agency members' relationships are defined and illustrated. By placing the patterns in relation to one another, the system of caregiving is revealed, and it is shown how the system moved or failed to move throughout the agency as a whole. This system of caregiving is discussed in terms of its multiple determinants and its implications for members' abilities to perform the agency's primary task of giving care to clients.

Mclachlan, A. (1995). A model of the relationship between stressors and affective well-being for nursing staff who work in long-term care facilities. Queen's University, Kingston.

Integrating findings from research on family caregivers of elderly persons, nursing stress and occupational stress, a model of the stress process for nursing staff in long-term care facilities was examined. Patient Characteristics (i.e., cognitive status, problem behaviour, impairment in activities of daily living), Social Support, and Role Stressors (i.e., role conflict, role ambiguity, home-work conflict) were hypothesized to be related to Affective Well-being (i.e., depression, anxiety, life satisfaction) through their influence on Appraisals of the Stressfulness of Patient Characteristics and Work Satisfaction. Self-report measures were collected from 146 nursing staff at homes for the aged, nursing homes, and chronic care hospitals at one point in time and 84 respondents completed the measures three months later. Latent variable structural equation modeling did not indicate support for the hypothesized model. However, a revised model was supported by the sample's responses at two different points in time. More role stressors were related to less work satisfaction. Low levels of cognitive impairment and higher levels of problem behaviours in the care-recipients were related to perceptions of impairment as more stressful. These perceptions, in turn, were related to affective well-being. Cross-lagged regressions indicated that this relationship was bi-directional and that reduced affective well-being negatively predicted work satisfaction. Implications were discussed for Lazarus and Folkman's (1984; Lazarus, 1991; 1993) theory of emotion and for models found in the family caregiver (Pearlin et al., 1990) and nursing stress literatures (Harris, 1989). Support for conducting longitudinal studies and for integrating related areas of research was provided by the present study.

Oliver, N., & Kuipers, E. (1996). Stress and its relationship to expressed emotion in community mental health workers. International Journal of Social Psychiatry, 42(2), 150-160. A study of Stress and Expressed Emotion (EE) was conducted with community mental health workers who dealt with clients with severe mental illness. Emotional exhaustion, depersonalization and General Health Questionnaire levels were found to be higher for the workers than for the general population but were not related to EE levels.

Pugliesi, K. (1999). The consequences of emotional labor: effects on work stress, job satisfaction, and well-being. Journal of Motivation and Emotion, 23(2), 125-154. Although early research suggested that the performance of emotional labor had deleterious effects on workers, recent empirical investigations have been equivocal. The performance of emotional labor appears to have diverse consequences for workers- both negative and positive. Variation in the consequences of emotional labor may be due to the different forms of emotion management involved. There is also evidence that the effects of emotional labor are specified by other work conditions. The effects of two forms of emotional labor on work stress, job satisfaction, and psychological distress-self-focused and other-focused emotion management-are explored using data from a survey of workers in a large organization. Results indicate that both forms of emotional labor have uniformly negative effects on workers, net of work complexity, control, and demands. Emotional labor increases perceptions of job stress, decreases satisfaction, and increases distress. Self-focused emotion management has the most pervasive and detrimental impacts. There is little evidence of interaction effects of work conditions and emotional labor.

Emotions Management

Frith, H. A., & Kitzinger, C. (1998). 'Emotion work' as a participant resource: a feminist analysis of young women's talk-in-interaction. Sociology, 32(2), 299-320. This paper explores and develops the concept of emotion work as used by young women talking about sexual negotiation. It suggests that emotion work should be viewed not simply as an analyst resource of use to social scientists, but also as a participant resource used by ordinary social members. Existing research on emotion work generally treats self-report data as offering a transparent window through which the behaviour behind the talk can be (more or less adequately) assessed. This paper proposes instead that self-report data should be considered as talk-in-interaction. Using data from our own research on young women's experiences of refusing sex, we show how young women's talk about (what analysts call) emotion work can be analysed as a participant resource through which young women construct consensual versions of men as emotional weaklings, and portray themselves as active agents who are knowledgeable about heterosexual relationships. The implications of this analytic shift are explored in relation to feminist approaches to sexual coercion, and with reference to qualitative data analysis more generally.

Gold, N. (1998). Using participatory research to help promote the physical and mental health of female social workers in child welfare. Child Welfare, 77(6), 701-724. Forty female workers from child welfare agencies were interviewed in focus groups regarding the positive and negative aspects of their work, their perceptions of its effects on their physical and mental health, and what they did in response to either cope or to protect their health. The results showed that despite certain positive aspects of their work, these women overwhelmingly

felt that their work had adversely affected both their physical and mental health, and that they used a variety of strategies (both problem focused and emotion focused) to cope. Implications are discussed in terms of the need for intervention at the micro-, mezzo-, and macrolevels, as well as in terms of the appropriateness of participatory research methods for future studies with this population.

Holm, K. E., Werner-Wilson R. J., & Cook, A. S. (2001). The association between emotion work balance and relationship satisfaction of couples seeking therapy. American Journal of Family Therapy, 29(3), 193-205.

This article is about emotions management, unpaid work and case study of couples.

Lois, J. (2001). Peaks and valleys: the gendered emotional culture of edgeworkers. Gender and Society, 15(3), 381- 406.

In this article, the author examines the gendered emotional culture of high-risk takers. Drawing on five and one-half years of ethnographic fieldwork with a volunteer search and rescue group, the author details the intense emotions rescuers experience before, during and after the most dangerous and upsetting rescues. Lyng's concepts of 'edgework' (voluntary risk taking) is used to analyze how male and female rescuers experienced, understood, and acted on their feelings. The data revealed gendered patterns that characterized this emotional culture. The article concludes with a discussion about gender, edgework, and emotional culture, focussing on the theoretical implications.

Rae, H. M. (1998). Managing Feelings: caregiving as emotion work. Research on Aging, 20(1), 137-160.

Part of a special issue on constructing, maintaining, and preserving aging identities. A study was conducted to examine caregiving as emotion work. Data were gathered from interviews with the familial caregivers of persons with Alzheimer's disease and from the findings from research conducted by others. Results indicated that caregivers are heavily engaged in an extensive amount of intense emotion work, are aware of feeling rules, and experience stress when they have not conformed to such rules. Symbolic interactionism demonstrated how failure in emotion management negatively affects the caregiver's sense of self. The results suggest that emotion work, especially failure to manage feelings, could well be a very important but as yet not well identified component of caregiver stress and burden.

Swan, E. (1994). Managing emotion. In M. Tanton. (Ed.), Women in Management. . London: Routledge.

This chapter is about emotions management in the paid work sphere.

Sylwester, R. (2000). Unconscious leadership. Educational Leadership, 58(3), 20- 24. Understanding the importance of and difference between emotions and feelings is crucial to effective teaching and learning. Emotion can serve as a biological thermostat and is thus central to cognition and educational practice.

Wharton, A. S., & Erickson, R. J. (1995). The consequences of caring: exploring the links between women's job and family emotion work. Sociological Quarterly, 36(Spring), 273-296. Sociologists of emotion have examined the ways that workers are required to manage their

emotions on the job, while studies of family emotion work reveal the effort involved in providing emotional support at home. Analyzing data collected from married or cohabiting women hospital workers, we examine the relations between women's job and family emotion work and the effects of both on women's job-related well-being. Consistent with "scarcity" views of women's emotional energy, we find that performance of family emotion work has negative consequences for women's job-related well-being. Consistent with "expansion" perspectives, however, women who perform some emotional labor on the job are more likely than other women to perform family emotion work. Our findings support a view that incorporates elements of both scarcity and expansion perspectives. We conclude that the job-related well-being of women hospital workers is less influenced by performance of emotional labor at work than it is by women's and their partners' involvement in family emotion work.

Wharton, A. S., & Erickson, R. J. (1993). Managing emotions on the job and at home: understanding the Academy of Management. Academy of Management Review, 18(3), 457-486. Work-family relations from the perspective of the emotion management performed by participants in both spheres is explored. Previous discussions of emotion management are extended by considering how work and family roles vary in the types and degrees of emotion management they require. The implications of this conception of work-family role variations in type and degree of emotion management for women's and men's work-family relations are explored, paying particular attention to gender differences in work-family conflict and work-family overload. The framework developed highlights the need to examine variability in the emotion-management requirements of social roles, and it calls for attention to workers' multiple role involvements in studies of emotion management and their effects on individuals.

Yang, G. (2000). Achieving emotions in collective action: emotional processes and movement mobilization in the 1989 Chinese student movement. The Sociological Quarterly, 41(4), 593-614.

This article outlines an emotional achievement perspective for the study of emotions in social movements. Following Denzin's work on emotions, I consider emotions as self-feelings that are situated, interactional, and temporal in nature. The concept of emotions as achievement complements Hochschild's emotion management perspective. While management focuses on control, achievement emphasizes articulation and creativity. I argue that, although individuals may be compelled to suppress feelings in the organizational context, different social contexts and practices make it possible for individuals to pursue emotional fulfillment and self-realization. In social movements, the process of emotional achievement among participants unfolds as a process of mobilization. An analysis of the emotional dynamics of the 1989 Chinese student movement shows that emotions were inextricably intertwined with identities and action and that emotional dynamics generated in this process significantly contributed to movement mobilization. The article concludes with a discussion of the theoretical contributions of the emotional achievement perspective. This article outlines an emotional achievement perspective for the study of emotions in social movements. Following Denzin's work on emotions, I consider emotions as self-feelings that are situated, interactional, and temporal in nature. The concept of emotions as achievement complements Hochschild's emotion management perspective. While management focuses on control, achievement emphasizes articulation and creativity. I argue that, although individuals may be compelled to suppress feelings in the organizational context, different social contexts and practices make it possible for individuals to pursue emotional fulfillment and self-realization. In

social movements, the process of emotional achievement among participants unfolds as a process of mobilization. An analysis of the emotional dynamics of the 1989 Chinese student movement shows that emotions were inextricably intertwined with identities and action and that emotional dynamics generated in this process significantly contributed to movement mobilization. The article concludes with a discussion of the theoretical contributions of the emotional achievement perspective.

Emotions in the workplace

Acker, S., & Webber, M. (2000). Pleasure and danger in academics' feelings about their work. Paper presented at the American Educational Research Association, New Orleans.

This is a presentation given at AERA in New Orleans. The authors look at "how close to the surface emotions can be, and how processes such as tenure and merit systems work upon the emotions, harnessing them in the service of enhancing 'performance'" (4) using a feminist perspective. Does not talk about how women professors learn to do the caring/emotion work that they do.

Ashforth, B. E., & Humphrey, R. H. (1995). Emotion in the workplace: a reappraisal. Human Relations, 48(2), 97-125.

Although the experience of work is saturated with emotion, research has generally neglected the impact of everyday emotions on organizational life. Further, organizational scholars and practitioners frequently appear to assume that emotionality is the antithesis of rationality and, thus, frequently hold a pejorative view of emotion. This has led to four institutionalized mechanisms for regulating the experience and expression of emotion in the workplace: (1) neutralizing, (2) buffering, (3) prescribing, and (4) normalizing emotion. In contrast to this perspective, we argue that emotionality and rationality are interpenetrated, emotions are an integral and inseparable part of organizational life, and emotions are often functional for the organization. This argument is illustrated by applications to motivation, leadership, and group dynamics.

Brown, R. B. (1997). Emotion in organizations: the case of English university business school academics. Journal of Applied Behavioural Science, 33, 247-262.

The writer employs aspects of the scientific method to expose the submerged variable of emotion in an organization. Her investigation is a by-product of a 1991 study of the academics of university business schools (UBSs) that was concerned with the knowledge strategies of such academics but that unintentionally revealed the deep feelings that UBS faculty have for their academic work, their discipline, the pursuit of knowledge, and their own business school. She discusses the concept of emotion at work, drawing on the relevant literature; the design and implementation of the survey that has given rise to the data; and the results regarding the feelings that underpin the attitudes and work of UBS academics in Britain and how they are linked to issues that arise from the literature. Finally, she draws some preliminary conclusions and discusses how the information revealed by this research might be utilized.

Chin, T. (2000). 'Sixth grade madness': parental emotion work in the private high school application process. Journal of Contemporary Ethnography, 29(2), 124-163.

This ethnographic look at sixth graders and their parents as they apply to private high schools

highlights the emotion work parents do as they push their children through a process they dislike. Parents manage their own emotions, forcing themselves to believe that the private school system is necessary, so that they can manage their children's emotions: motivating them, preparing them for disappointment, and comforting them.

Cottle, M., and, Kuipers, G. M., & Oakes, P. (1995). Expressed emotion, attributions and coping in staff who have been victims of violent incidents. Mental Health Research, 8(3), 168-183.

In some occupations, there is an increased risk of becoming a victim of a violent incident. Nursing and care work, in settings for people with learning disabilities and challenging behaviour, or who have mental health needs, are occupations which can involve such a risk. This study examined how staff felt, after a violent incident, towards the perpetrator of the incident (expressed emotion), and the reasons (attributions) that the care staff gave as to their belief about the cause of the incident. Coping was investigated by looking at measures of anxiety. Results indicated that anxiety was often increased a week after the incident but then returned to baseline levels after a month. Expressed emotion was often high after an incident, and remained high a month later. Reasons that staff gave about the cause of the violent incident varied but they seldom blamed themselves for the incident. They tended to make attributions which were internal to the client, external to themselves, personal to the client, uncontrollable by themselves, and neither controllable nor uncontrollable by the client.

Fineman, S. (1997). Emotion and management learning. Management Learning, 28(1), 13-25.

This article argues that what and how learning takes place for managers is inextricably emotional, or of emotions. The traditional cognitive approach to management learning has obscured the presence and role of emotion. The conceptual positioning of emotion is reviewed, illustrated through 'competencies' and 'business ethics'. It is concluded that we need more explicit frameworks, derived from the wider organizational literature on emotion, to place emotion as both a product and process of learning. Special attention is required to the growth of corporate emotion engineering, 'flexible' work structures and 'virtual' managing. These areas raise challenging technical and moral questions for 'learning' theorists and practitioners.

Groves, J. M. (1995). Learning to feel: the neglected sociology of social movements. Sociological Review, 43(3), 435-461.

This paper discusses the experience and ideology of emotions among animal rights activists, and more broadly, the applicability of the sociology of emotions to the field of social movements. I examine the case of a social movement which relies heavily on empathy in its initial recruitment, and which has been derisively labeled by outsiders as 'emotional'. I explain recruitment to animal rights activism by showing how activists develop a 'vocabulary of emotions' to rationalize their participation to others and themselves, along with managing the emotional tone of the movement by limiting the kinds of people who can take part in debates about animal cruelty. The interactive nature in which emotions develop in social movement literature, which treat emotions as impulsive or irrational.

Higgins Kessler, M. R., Werner-Wilson, R. J., Skinner Cook, A., & Berger, P. (2000). Emotion management of marriage and family therapists: how is it different for women and men?

American Journal of Family Therapy, 28(3), 243-253.

Most schools of family therapy directly or indirectly recognize that personal qualities of the therapist influence therapy process. The present study examines the relationship between emotion management at home and emotion management at work to job satisfaction and marital satisfaction of marriage and family therapists.

Martin, J., Knopoff, K., & Beckman, C. (1998). An alternative to bureaucratic impersonality and emotional labor: bounded emotionality at The Body Shop. Administrative Science Quarterly, 43(2), 429-469.

Using qualitative data from a large, successful private sector corporation (The Body Shop International), which was managed and staffed by an unusually high proportion of women, this paper questions whether norms of impersonality need be a defining characteristic of large organizations. We also ask whether displays of emotions in organizations need to be managed primarily for instrumental purposes, a form of emotional labor that entails costs for employees. This paper explores the viability of an alternative emotion management approach, "bounded emotionality," which encourages the constrained expression of emotions at work in order to encourage community building and personal well-being in the workplace. We show how bounded emotionality was enacted and explore difficulties in its implementation, including pressures on employees who prefer impersonality and the dangers of a deeper and more intimate form of controlling employees. Results show that rapid firm growth, a limited labor market, and the pressures of a competitive marketplace serve as boundary conditions for the maintenance of bounded emotionality. Using qualitative data from a large, successful private sector corporation (The Body Shop International), which was managed and staffed by an unusually high proportion of women, this paper questions whether norms of impersonality need be a defining characteristic of large organizations. We also ask whether displays of emotions in organizations need to be managed primarily for instrumental purposes, a form of emotional labor that entails costs for employees. This paper explores the viability of an alternative emotion management approach, "bounded emotionality," which encourages the constrained expression of emotions at work in order to encourage community building and personal well-being in the workplace. We show how bounded emotionality was enacted and explore difficulties in its implementation, including pressures on employees who prefer impersonality and the dangers of a deeper and more intimate form of controlling employees. Results show that rapid firm growth, a limited labor market, and the pressures of a competitive marketplace serve as boundary conditions for the maintenance of bounded emotionality.

Morgan, J. A. (1991). Educating the emotions. , Simon Fraser University, Vancouver.

This thesis is intended as a philosophical contribution to the problem of whether it is possible for educators to engage in practices, which contribute to the emotional improvement of their students. The thesis does not argue that educating the emotions is a distinct type of education, but rather that educators can improve the emotional lives of children principally by ensuring that students acquire as well-rounded a liberal education as possible. Special emphasis is placed on the study of literature in this regard.

Mumby, D. K., & Putnam, L. L. (1992). The politics of emotion: a feminist reading of bounded rationality. Academy of Management, 17(3), 465-486.

A poststructuralist feminist reading of Herbert Simon's construct, bounded rationality, is

presented. Following from this notion, it is maintained that, even though bounded rationality provides a modified critique of pure rationality, this concept is grounded in male-centered assumptions that exclude alternative modes of organizing. Through a feminist deconstructive process, bounded emotionality is introduced as an alternative organizing construct. In bounded emotionality, nurturance, caring, community, supportiveness, and interrelatedness are fused with individual responsibility to shape organizational experiences. The premises, conditions of organizing, and implications of this alternative are discussed and illustrated. Finally, theorists are urged to move beyond the traditional dichotomy between rationality and emotionality in order to question the assumptions that underlie traditional constructs and to create new grounds for future theoretical activities.

Pederson, P. P. (2001). Managing emotion in organizational change: emotion management as power. Paper presented at the Critical Management, Manchester, UK.

How power works through the handling of emotion of others is analysed by a case example from a study on emotions in organizational change. This case is a starting point for the theoretical argument that power analysis can benefit from analyzing how emotions are engendered as part of power processes, and not merely repressed or controlled. The analysis elaborates and applies the analytical possibilities of the notion of 'other emotion management', which seems particularly relevant work/coping compared to routine situations. I analyze from a perspective on emotion that emphasizes productive and performative dimensions of emotional life, and this emotional kind of power is distinguished from management of meaning (legitimacy, discourse). Hereby, the paper aims at contributing to a development of power theory and analysis, which has been too cognitively biased.

Van Maanen, J., & Erickson, R. J. (1989). "Real feelings": emotional expression and organizational culture. Research in Organizational Behavior, 11, 43- 103.

The display of emotion at work is the concern of this paper. An argument is developed that links the rules that govern emotional expression to the cultural understandings organizational members hold as to what is proper and improper behavior in the workplace. The paper begins with some examples of emotional display at work and notes the ritualized form of such display. The following sections provide working definitions for culture and emotion and tie the two together conceptually. The main body of the paper presents two brief ethnographies detailing how organizational life is structured to channel, mold, enhance, sustain, challenge, and otherwise influence the feeling or organizational members- toward the organization itself, others in the organization, customers of the organization, and, crucially, themselves. Disneyland and High Technology Incorporated (a pseudonym) are the two organizations studied. The paper concludes by considering how these two organizational cultures are built and maintained, as well as the emotional costs and benefits membership within them provides.

Part II: Emotion Work Literature

Caring Labour

Acker, S. (1999). Caring as work for women educators. In S. A. Elizabeth Smyth, Paula Borne and Alison Prentice (Ed.), Challenging Professions: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives on Women's Professional Work. (pp. 277-295). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

In the essay that follows I explore a certain kind of experience that I believe is common in the caring professions and in university teaching particularly for women. The work required in these occupations often calls on a 'caring script', a set of expectations that mimics women's traditional work in the home. These expectations are often unrealistic in the conditions of the work world, but they may form part of the worker's sense of self, as well as being reinforced in various ways from the outside, and thus be difficult to dislodge, even when not well rewarded in material or status terms. The nearest I have come to a name for this syndrome is Jean Baker Miller's phrase 'doing good and felling bad'. To develop and illustrate my argument, I draw on two sets of data, concerned respectively with teaching at the elementary and post-secondary levels.

Austin, B. L. (1993). Women's experience of becoming a counsellor: a phenomenological inquiry. , University of Victoria, Victoria.

This study investigated, from a phenomenological perspective, women's experience of becoming a counsellor. As the review of the literature indicates, many women choose occupations that involve providing service to, and caring for others. In addition, many women may unconsciously choose these careers due to the sex-role socialization process. Although research has explored factors influencing the career choices of those involved in the helping professions, most of this research has focused on isolating and manipulating variables thought to effect the career choices of helping professionals. Three professional counsellors were interviewed for this study. First, a narrative was written for each woman emphasizing reoccurring themes; second, an overall account of all three women's experiences was composed, indicating the fundamental structure of the experience of becoming a counsellor for the women in this study. The overall account noted similarities as well as differences in the three women's stories. Results of the study showed that the women's experiences of becoming counsellors began in childhood and carried on throughout their adulthood. Reoccurring themes were found within the individual accounts as well as in the three women's stories combined. Major reoccurring themes for all three participants included nurturing, supporting, listening to, taking responsibility for and caring for others throughout the course of the participants' lives. In addition, all three participants developed a desire to understand the psychological worlds of themselves as well as those of others. Finally, the women emphasized that they were not always conscious of how they came to be counsellors; it just felt like a natural thing to do. The concluding chapter of this thesis discussed relationships between the present findings and the literature, application of the present findings for counsellors and counsellor educators, and recommendations for future research.

Bellas, M. L. (1999). Emotional labor in academia: the case of professors. The Annals of American Academy, 561(1), 96-110.

Most professors divide their time between teaching, research, service, and, for some, administration. As in the nonacademic labor market, there is a gendered reward structure in academia. Teaching and service are most closely aligned with characteristics and behaviors culturally defined as feminine, and , in aggregate, women spend more time in these activities than men. Teaching and service clearly involve substantial amounts of emotional labor, but this labor is generally not seen as involving valued skills and is consequently poorly rewarded. In contrast, research and administration are associated with traits culturally defined as masculine, and , on average, men spend more time in these activities. Although research and administration also involve emotional labor, their emotional aspects are largely ignored, while intellectual, technical, or leadership skills are emphasized and highly compensated. Aside from different

activities and the gendered reward structure associated with these activities, even when the tasks are the same, the type and intensity of emotional labor required of the sexes may differ.

Benoit, C., & Heitlinger, A. (1998). Women's health care work in comparative perspective: Canada, Sweden and Czechoslovakia/Czech Republic as case examples. Social Science and Medicine, 47(8), 1101-1111.

This paper contends that there is no single definition of caring work, that it holds no intrinsic meaning in and of itself. While in every human society there are work tasks that involve caring for others unable to adequately care for themselves, such caring work is almost always assigned in accordance with the overriding gender systems. However, different economic structures and gender ideologies, supported by different types of state formations, tend to organize caring work in a multiplicity of ways. Drawing on data from primary and secondary research on the related health care occupations of mid-wifery, obstetrical nursing, and general nursing in three societal locations--Canada Sweden and Czechoslovakia/Czech Republic--the authors suggest that the social organization of women's health caring work is the product of a complex interweaving old factors. The formation of the state, and the specific social construction of the public and private spheres of society, play consequential roles in this process.

Cameron, N. E. (1998). Teaching from the water: soul as the source of care in nursing education, University of Western Ontario, London, Ont.

Nursing education has a long history of relationships dominated by a culture of oppression. Indeed, the institutions in which nursing dwells themselves echo the values of patriarchy. For decades the traditional nursing curriculum itself, housed in behaviorist pedagogy, has reinforced the discourse of domination within the student-teacher relationship, both in the classroom and in the clinical settings. A change in paradigm is not sufficient to undo the damage of both personal and societal domination. Transformation necessitates more than a change in pedagogy. Academic understanding of a caring paradigm is not enough to ensure healed relationships and lived experience that sheds itself of patriarchy. It is too engrained. Without attention to personal and societal contexts, nurse educators risk 'talking' within the new paradigm, yet 'living' within the old. In responding to these concerns this research examines the behavioral and caring curriculums, considering historical and contemporary features within this society, and compares the styles of educational interaction. In addition the research addresses two forms of transformation, personal and societal. Each are needed to bridge the gap between paradigm change as learned or known, and paradigm change as internalized, guided from within, derived from the soul of the nurse educator.

Crawford, M. J. (1993). The lived experience of nurse educators: caring experience with students in clinical teaching, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg.

Proponents of a paradigm change in nursing education focus on the need to transform student-teacher relationships from the traditional teacher role marked by authority and power to one characterized by reciprocity and caring. Although caring has been cited by many authors as the essence of nursing and the core value of nursing education, the concept of caring in nursing education has remained largely unexamined and undefined. If caring is to be a core value in nursing education, nurse educators have little guidance as to how this caring teacher-student relationship would be manifested and developed. This research study used Heideggerian phenomenology to explore the paradigm case exemplars of nine experienced clinical nurse

educators with regard to caring in baccalaureate nursing clinical education. The research method included a pre-interview, a paradigm interview, and a final interview to clarify perceptions of the paradigm interview and to share the emerging categories with the participant. Hermeneutic analysis was achieved through data analysis according to the steps identified by Collaizi (1978). The study identified the motivation to care for students as arising from the conceptualization of caring as a human trait and caring as a moral imperative. The selection of strategies of caring reflected conceptualizations of caring as an affect and an interpersonal interaction. Caring as a therapeutic intervention was expressed in a number of complex strategies. Uncaring was identified as shielding students from unpleasant realities and taking over client care from students.

Davies, C. (1995). Competence versus care? Gender and caring work revisited. Acta Sociologica, 38(1), 17-31.

The writer discusses caring work and argues that masculinist visions gender the concepts of bureaucracy and profession, dichotomizing competence and care and obscuring both the reality and the potential of public carework. She begins with a new definition of caring work and proposes a distinction between caregiving, carework, and professional care as forms of this work. She then explores dilemmas of professional care by reference to a recent campaign by the Royal College of Nursing, the leading nurses' organization in the U.K., that sought to highlight the worth and value of nursing work. She notes that the carework discussion has hardly any echo in the debate about new managerialism in the public sector and maintains that a critical understanding of the centrality of binary gendered thought is essential for a useful critique of the current emphasis on putting health care in the marketplace.

Ebenstein, H. (1998). They were once like us: learning from home care workers who care for the elderly. Journal of Gerontological Social Work, 30(3-4), 191-201.

Interviews were held with six outstanding home care workers about the qualities needed to work with the elderly and the importance of establishing caring relationships with their clients. The greatest satisfaction was derived from seeing clients improve as a result of their efforts and learning from the life experiences of their clients.

Eldridge, J. S. (1996). Teachers who care: a narrative journey into the development of the safe place. , University of Toronto, Toronto.

As the paths of our lives intersect we are frequently left wondering about the significance of certain meaningful encounters which shape and often script our life stories. Sometimes the significance is obvious as overt changes begin to take place in our lives. However, all too often, the relevancy of such encounters is much more subtle, almost seamless in the implications they have for our futures. Such is the nature of this thesis. While, perhaps seamless and cathartic in its creation, there is an implicitness in the underlying themes of the text. As the author of this work I invite my readers to pursue these tacit messages and, in narrative tradition, realize the interconnectedness of peoples' lives. It is my dissertation, integrated with the writings of many respected others, that caring is an essential component of what makes us human, what allows us to grow and be nurtured into a role of caring for others, especially as educators. Without the cultivation of this very human need we are quite possibly destined to repeat the patterns of others, especially those who have gone before us, as we continue to allow them to script our stories. This thesis attempts to challenge my readers to understand the significance of caring and

the importance of providing this human need in a ``safe place.`` At the same time I propose that an uncaring cycle can, as evidenced in this work, be broken. The relevance of this thesis is implicit and lies in the stories told in both autobiographical and biographical form. The challenge for future inquiry lies in the relationships my readers can make to their own stories and the stories of others whose lives cross theirs. It provides a springboard for the use of narrative inquiry into understanding the complexities of care. This thesis is written for those children who need care and for those who are in a caregiving role so that they may identify, understand and make every effort to provide a ``safe place.``

England, P., & Folbre, N. (1999). The cost of caring. The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 561(Jan), 39-51.

Part of a special issue on emotional labor in the service economy. The writers address the issue of why caring jobs offer low pay relative to their requirements for education and skill. Cultural sexism militates against recognizing the value of the work because caring work is associated with women. In addition, the intrinsic reward that people receive from helping others may allow employers to fill the jobs for lower pay. Furthermore, the fact that people feel uneasy about putting a price on care limits the pay offered.

Himmelweit, S. (1999). Caring labor. The Annals of American Academy, 561(1), 27- 38. Caring has two different aspects: the motivation of caring for other people and the activity of caring for them. Furthermore, good-quality care depends on the developing relationship between a carer and the person cared for. In paid employment, however, relationships are usually assumed to be reduced to an exchange transaction and motivation purely monetary, provoking concern about whether paying for care diminishes its quality and authenticity. Similar issues have arisen in the context of emotional labor more generally. Much emotional labor, however, is of a transitory nature in which no long-term relationship is set up between worker and customer. This article argues that because of the relationship that tends to develop, caring occupations should be seen as part of a whole class of occupations that are not fully commodified, in which workers have motivations that are not purely monetary and also care about the results of their work.

Hoff, L. A. (1994). Violence issues: an interdisciplinary curriculum guide for health professionals. Ottawa: Health Canada, Health Services Directorate, Mental Health Division.

Health care providers are in strategic positions to prevent violence, detect risk and victimization of vulnerable groups, and provide services to survivors of abuse as well as to their assailants. This guide is intended to aid those in the health professions to address violence prevention and the care of abused clients in a matter that is comprehensive in scope, sensitive to the sociocultural, political and psychological roots of violence, attentive to new insights, and humane, caring, and skilled. The guide begins with a concise introduction to the literature on violence and on the essential knowledge, attitudes, and skills for violence prevention and victim or survivor care. It then presents ethnographic examples of abuse situations, each discussing implications for education of health professionals. Final sections of the guide cover implementation issues and strategies for health services, including a comprehensive clinical service for a battered women as an example.